

Comparative Analysis Of Service Quality On Patient Satisfaction Levels In Government And Private Hospitals In Medan City In 2022

Bebie Ayura¹, Sri Wahyuni Nasution², Rapael Ginting^{3*}

^{1,2,3} Master of Public Health Study Program, Faculty of Medicine, Dentistry and Health Sciences, Prima University of Indonesia, Medan, Indonesia

*Corresponding authors:

Email: rafaelginting@unprimdn.ac.id

Abstract.

This study compares service quality to patient satisfaction in government and private hospitals in Medan City in 2022. This study used a survey method using a questionnaire as a data collection instrument. The research respondents were patients who used government and private hospital services. The data collected includes service quality dimensions, such as tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy. In addition, the data also consists of the level of patient satisfaction with the services provided by the hospital. Comparative analysis of service quality and patient satisfaction levels was carried out using appropriate statistical techniques, such as testing the difference between two groups of hospitals (government vs. private) using appropriate statistical tests. The results of this analysis will provide an understanding of the differences in service quality between government and private hospitals, as well as the related level of patient satisfaction. This research is expected to contribute to the development and improvement of health services in hospitals, especially in the city of Medan. The results of this study can also be input for hospital management to improve service quality and patient satisfaction. Thus, hospitals can provide better services and meet patient expectations to enhance the reputation and competitiveness of both government and private hospitals in Medan City. Especially in the city of Medan. The results of this study can also be input for hospital management to improve service quality and patient satisfaction. Thus, hospitals can provide better services and meet patient expectations to enhance the reputation and competitiveness of both government and private hospitals in Medan City. Especially in the city of Medan. The results of this study can also be input for hospital management to improve service quality and patient satisfaction. Thus, hospitals can provide better services and meet patient expectations to enhance the reputation and competitiveness of both government and private hospitals in Medan City.

Keywords: Service Quality, Patient Satisfaction, Government Hospitals and Private Hospitals.

I. INTRODUCTION

Hospitals are health service institutions with a strategic role in improving public health status (KARS, 2017). Organizing hospitals aim to improve the quality of health services and provide legal certainty to patients. Patients expect ready, fast, responsive, and comfortable services for their disease complaints. In improving health services, hospitals must improve the quality of better services, including preventive services, to improve the quality of life and provide patient satisfaction. Hospitals must also compete with other hospitals to gain public trust through efficient and quality services (Wahdania et al., 2015). Patient satisfaction is essential in maintaining hospital operations' continuity and building patient loyalty (Suwarno et al., 2023). Measuring patient satisfaction can be done through various methods, such as a survey using the SERVQUAL instrument, which is tangible, reliable, responsive, assurance, and empathy (Parasuraman et al., 1988). The quality of health services also has an essential role in patient satisfaction (Donabedian, 1989). Service quality can be seen from three categories, namely structure (attributes of hospital settings), process (what is done in providing services), and outcomes (effect of services on the health status of patients and population). Hospitals are required to meet the minimum service standards that have been set and strive to improve service quality through hospital accreditation (Alkuwaiti et al., 2020; Suwarno et al., 2023).

Other factors can influence patient satisfaction, such as the hospital's brand image, smooth communication between health workers and patients, and handling patient complaints and suggestions (Safitri & Kautsar, 2013). The role of hospital management is crucial in improving services and facilities for consumers/patients, including building adequate facilities and infrastructure (Ramez, 2012). Complaints from patients are also valuable input for hospitals to improve and improve service quality. Patient complaints must be taken seriously and seen as an evaluation of hospital services (Wahdania et al., 2015). This can assist the management in knowing the strengths and weaknesses of the hospital and making the necessary improvements (Kementrian Kesehatan RI, 2009) To improve service to patients, hospitals need to pay

attention to aspects of service quality, such as physical facilities, reliability, responsiveness, assurance / certainty, and empathy. Success in providing quality health services and satisfying patients will provide a competitive advantage for hospitals in maintaining their competitiveness (Waine et al., 2022).

II. METHODS

1. Types of research

This study used an analytical approach to compare patient satisfaction with the quality of service at government and private hospitals in Medan City in 2021. in the excellent category. The research was carried out between May and December 2021. The study population consisted of outpatients at 15 type B government and private hospitals in Medan City. Hospitals that are part of the population are as follows: Pringgadi Hospital, Bhayangkara Hospital, Santa Elisabeth Hospital, Hernan Hospital, Mitra Sejati Hospital, Indonesian Worker Imelda Hospital, Marta Friska Hospital, Permata Bunda Hospital, Medan Hajj Hospital, Columbia Asia Hospital, Marta Friska Multatuli Hospital, Teguh Murni Hospital, Royal Prima Hospital, Provincial Special Eye Hospital and Bina Kasih Hospital. In this study, two data collection techniques were used, namely primary data and secondary data.

Primary data was obtained directly from the respondents using a previously prepared questionnaire (Sugiyono, 2019). Respondents in question are patients who are undergoing outpatient treatment at the hospital. The questionnaire was designed to collect information related to service quality and patient satisfaction. In addition, secondary data was also used in this study. Secondary data was obtained from two primary sources. First, data on the number of outpatient visits at the Medan City Hospital were obtained through documentation provided by the hospital. This data source provides information regarding patient visit rates relevant to the study. Second, library references and related literature are also used to support this research (Soekidjo Notoatmodjo, 2012). Research variables are everything that will become the object of research observation (Suwarno & Nugroho, 2023). The variables in this study are the combination of primary and secondary data which is expected to be able to understand the variables of service quality and patient satisfaction in the hospital comprehensively.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Univariate analysis

Based on research on the comparison of service quality and patient satisfaction levels in public and private hospitals in Medan City in 2022, the respondent's data related to the variables age, length of work, and education can be explained descriptively as follows:

Table 4.1. Frequency Distribution of Respondent Characteristics at Government General Hospitals (Bhayangkara Hospital and Dr. Pirnggadi Hospital Medan) in 2022

Characteristics	Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)
Age	≤48 years	37,9
	> 49 years	52,1
Total	48	100.0
Gender	Man	45,8
	Woman	54,2
Total	48	100.0
Education	Elemntry School	18,8
	Junior School	12,5
	High School	43,8
	Bachelor	25,0
Total	48	100.0
Work	Housekeeper	22,9
	Farmer	6,3
	Employee	4,2
	Self-Employed	20,8
	Civil Servant	12,5
	Other	33,3
Total	48	100.0

Based on the data in Table 4.1, it can be concluded that most respondents are over 45 years of age, with a total of 25 people (52.1%). Most respondents were also women, with 26 people (54.2%). Regarding the level of education, as many as 21 people (43.8%) had a high school educational background. In addition, 16 people (33.3%) of the respondents worked in other fields.

Table 4.2. Frequency Distribution of Respondent Characteristics in Private Hospitals (Martha Friska Hospital and Bina Kasih Hospital) Medan Year 2022

Characteristics		Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)
Age	≤ 42 years	32	66,7
	> 43 years	16	33,3
	Total	48	100.0
Gender	Man	20	41,7
	Woman	28	58,3
	Total	48	100.0
Education	Elementary	9	18,8
	Junior School	5	10,4
	High School	22	45,8
	Bachelor	12	25,0
	Total	48	100.0
Work	Housekeeper	9	18,8
	Farmer	5	10,4
	Employee	11	22,9
	Self-Employed	3	6,3
	Civil Servant	2	4,2
	Other	18	37,5
	Total	48	100.0

Table 4.2 shows that most respondents in private, public hospitals are less than 42 years old, namely 32 people (66.7%). Univariate analysis regarding patient satisfaction with the results of service quality in government hospitals is described as follows:

Table 4.3. Comparison of Quality of Service to Patient Satisfaction Government Hospital in Medan City Year 2022

Quality Against Patient Satisfaction		Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)
1. <i>Tangibles</i>	Not good	18	37,5
	Good	30	62,5
	Total	48	100.0
2. <i>Reliability</i>	Not good	32	66,7
	Good	16	33,3
	Total	48	100.0
3. <i>Responsiveness</i>	Not good	38	79,2
	Good	10	20,8
	Total	48	100.0
4. <i>Assurance</i>	Not good	45	93,8
	Good	3	6,3
	Total	48	100.0
5. <i>Empathy</i>	Not good	43	89,6
	Good	5	10,4
	Total	48	100.0

Based on Table 4.3 above, it is known that the majority of service quality levels in government hospitals in Medan City in terms of tangible are in the excellent category, namely 30 people (62.5%). In terms of reliability, the category is not good, 32 people (66.7%), responsiveness with the unfavorable category, namely 38 people (79.2%), assurance with the unfavorable category, namely 45 people (93.8%), and empathy with the unfavorable category, namely 43 people (89.6%). The results of the univariate analysis regarding the comparison of service quality to patient satisfaction in private hospitals are described as follows:

Table 4.4. Comparison of Service Quality Against Patient Satisfaction in Private Hospitals in Medan City Year 2022

	Satisfaction	Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)
1. <i>Tangibles</i>	Not good	15	31,3
	Good	33	68,8
	Total	48	100.0
2. <i>Reliability</i>	Not good	11	22,9
	Good	37	77,1
	Total	48	100.0
3. <i>Responsiveness</i>	Not good	12	25,0
	Good	36	75,0
	Total	48	100.0
4. <i>Assurance</i>	Not good	19	39,6
	Good	29	60,4
	Total	48	100.0
5. <i>Empathy</i>	Not good	14	29,2
	Good	34	70,8
	Total	48	100.0

Based on Table 4.4 above, it is known that the majority of service quality on patient satisfaction in private hospitals in Medan City in terms of tangibles is in a good category, namely 33 people (68.8%), in terms of reliability, it is in a good category, 37 people (77.1%), responsiveness with a good category, namely 36 people (75.0%), assurance with a good category, namely 29 people (60.4%) and empathy with a good category, namely 34 people (70.8%).

2. Bivariate Analysis

Based on data analysis for the bivariate test phase, the data obtained was not normally distributed (P-value <0.05) (Ghozali, 2018), so the test used to analyze differences in service quality on patient satisfaction in government and private hospitals in Medan City used the Mann-Whitney test from each -each variable to variable is described as follows:

Table 4.4. Test Results for Differences in Service Quality on Patient Satisfaction Levels at Government and Private Hospitals in Medan City

Service Quality on Satisfaction	Mean Ranking	Mann Whitney	P-values	Information
<i>1. Tangible</i>				
Private Hospital	52.89	941.5000	0.090	No difference
Government Hospital	44,11			
<i>2. Reliability</i>				
Private Hospital	59,92	604,000	0.000	There is a significant difference
Government Hospital	37.08			
<i>3. Responsiveness</i>				
Private Hospital	61.25	540,000	0.000	There is a difference.
Government Hospital	35.75			
<i>4. Assurance</i>				
Private Hospital	37,46	622,000	0.000	There is a significant difference
Government Hospital	59,54			
<i>5. Empathy</i>				
Private Hospital	56.07	788,500	0.006	There is a significant difference
Government Hospital	40.93			

Based on the different test analyses with Mann Whitney comparison of service quality to patient satisfaction in government and private hospitals in Medan City, the test score produces a significant probability value known in the Reliability dimension (p-value 0.000 <0.05), the Assurance dimension (p-value 0.000 <0.05), and the Empathy dimension (p-value 0.006 <0.05).

3. Comparison of Service Quality from a Tangible Perspective on Patient Satisfaction in Government and Private Hospitals in Medan City in 2021

The study results show that the quality of service in government and private hospitals in Medan City in terms of tangible (physical evidence) has a good category. Most patients are satisfied with a particular room for health services, a safe and comfortable information service room, and a service room that looks

neat and clean. However, there are differences between the two types of hospitals in terms of the information provided. Some patients are dissatisfied with government hospitals' lack of information brochures, while private hospitals provide information through the hospital's service information section. The facilities provided by the hospital are an essential factor in increasing patient satisfaction. The patient will be satisfied if the facilities meet their needs and provide comfort. The patient's assessment of hospital conditions is a picture of the quality of the hospital based on the patient's subjective experience. The bivariate analysis results showed no significant difference between service quality and patient satisfaction at government and private hospitals in Medan City. This may be due to the high patient satisfaction with the tangibles of the hospital, as stated in previous studies. If the patient's perception of the physical evidence of the hospital is good, then the level of patient satisfaction will also be high. However, hospitals need to have adequate supporting facilities, both medical and non-medical, such as laboratories, pharmaceutical installations, radiology, and patient food services. These supporting facilities can affect the quality of hospital services and ultimately affect patient satisfaction, especially inpatients.

4. Comparison of Service Quality in terms of Reliability on Outpatient Satisfaction at Government and Private Hospitals in Medan City in 2021

The study results show differences between the quality of service in government and private hospitals in Medan regarding the dimensions of reliability on patient satisfaction. In government hospitals, some patients are dissatisfied with the services of hospital staff in providing information about service lines and the lack of assistance when patients experience difficulties. However, facilities and infrastructure are considered adequate, and officers use language that patients can understand, although they do not provide information regarding activities related to patient health that need to be avoided. Meanwhile, in private hospitals, patients are satisfied with the services of staff who provide information about service routes and are ready to help when patients experience difficulties. Facilities and infrastructure are also considered adequate, and officers use language that patients can understand and provide information regarding activities that need to be avoided related to patient health. The bivariate analysis results show a significant difference between the quality of service in government and private hospitals regarding the reliability dimension of patient satisfaction. This difference is related to the response and communication of hospital staff in providing information to patients. Hospital staff must have a caring attitude toward the patient's health condition and provide attention and care when the patient is in the hospital. This study's results align with previous studies, which show that reliability positively affects patient satisfaction. Expertise, politeness, sympathy, communication, and interpersonal skills of hospital staff are essential to increase patient satisfaction. Hospital staff needs to realize that patient healing is not only determined by drugs but also influenced by how the services are provided, such as attitudes, skills, and knowledge.

5. Comparison of Service Quality in terms of Responsiveness to Patient Satisfaction in Government and Private Hospitals in Medan City in 2021

Most patients in government hospitals (79.2%) and private hospitals (75.0%) gave poor and good ratings regarding responsiveness to service quality. At government hospitals, patients feel that the officers need to be more responsive in responding quickly, less responsive in dealing with complaints, and nurses are less friendly in providing services. Meanwhile, in private hospitals, staff responsiveness is considered better. Responsiveness is the ability of health workers to help and provide fast and appropriate services to patients. This is an essential factor in the hospital's progress because when patients feel the response from the hospital is satisfactory, they will recommend the hospital to other people who need treatment. Previous studies have also shown that responsiveness positively and significantly affects patient satisfaction. Bivariate analysis showed a significant difference between the quality of service in the responsiveness dimension between government and private hospitals. Private hospitals try harder to provide the best service, hoping that patients will continue to come to the hospital and recommend it to others. This study's results align with previous studies, which show a significant effect of responsiveness on patient satisfaction. Health services must be able to respond to every patient complaint. The high level of responsiveness from the hospital gives confidence to patients that they will always get help. Other studies also show that responsiveness is the most dominant factor in patient satisfaction.

6. Comparison of Service Quality in terms of Assurance of Patient Satisfaction in Government and Private Hospitals in Medan City in 2021

Most patients in government hospitals (93.8%) and private hospitals (60.4%) gave poor and good ratings, respectively, in the assurance dimension of service quality. At government hospitals, patients feel there is no guarantee if an error occurs. Nurses are less friendly in serving and need to be more responsive to patient complaints. The lack of friendliness of nurses can affect the patient's desire to return to the hospital for treatment. Previous research also shows that the assurance dimension can be seen from the knowledge of hospital staff in answering patient questions, employee ethics, and guarantees of safety from the hospital. The existence of a guarantee of safety from the hospital makes patients feel safe and without any doubts when seeking treatment. Bivariate analysis showed significant differences between service quality in the dimensions of assurance on patient satisfaction between government and private hospitals. The services provided by private hospitals are considered better by patients than government hospitals.

This may be due to the guarantee of safety felt by patients in private hospitals, so they feel safe and believe that the hospital has professional doctors. In addition, nurses are also considered friendly in providing services and responsive to patient complaints. The reliability of doctors and nurses in providing health services also affects inpatient satisfaction because the reliability and skills of health workers in providing care will increase the patient's sense of comfort in receiving services. This study's results align with previous studies, which show a positive and significant effect of the assurance dimension on patient satisfaction. The better the patient's perception of assurance, the higher the level of patient satisfaction. Patient satisfaction will be high if the patient's perception of assurance is good. Guarantees provided by the hospital as a service provider affect patient satisfaction. Other studies also support a relationship between the dimensions of assurance and patient satisfaction in various health service contexts. Overall, the services provided by health workers in a polite, courteous, and professional manner, as well as the guarantee of patient safety, are essential factors in the assurance dimension. The results of this study are also in line with other studies which show the effect of guarantees on patient satisfaction at the hospital.

7. Comparison of Service Quality in terms of Empathy on Patient Satisfaction in Government and Private Hospitals in Medan City in 2021

The results of the study on the univariate analysis found that the quality of service in terms of empathy for patient satisfaction at government hospitals was in the unfavorable category, namely 43 people (89.6%), and in private hospitals, the majority were in the excellent category, namely 34 people (70.8%). The empathy dimension in government hospitals is considered poor because patients have to ask for information about health services without being given a more detailed explanation; officers are less friendly in providing information to patients and providing services with a friendly attitude and seeming attentive to patient complaints. This is the opinion of Al Khattab, who stated that the main complaints about services in government hospitals are responsiveness and empathy related to service delays and short consultation times (Al Khattab & Aldehayyat, 2011). This deficiency is the main reason for government hospitals' poor perception of service quality.

Meanwhile, Faisal found a relationship between satisfaction between responsiveness and caring (empathy) dimensions (Faisal et al., 2020). The bivariate analysis results found differences in service quality in terms of empathy for patient satisfaction in government and private hospitals, with a p-value of 0.006. The service quality of the caring dimension (Empathy), the component that stands out as a measuring tool, is convenience and communication. The convenience in question is the ease of interacting with health workers and obtaining information. Ease for patients to interact and meet with health workers such as doctors or nurses is an important thing that must be implemented by service providers so that patients feel comfortable and calm while receiving hospital services. The study's results align with research conducted by Suwarno, which states that empathy (X5) positively influences patient satisfaction (Suwarno et al., 2023). Based on the research results conducted by Suwarno, nurses often consider the empathy dimension not too crucial. However, this element becomes essential for patients from certain circles (upper middle class). They feel that their ego, status, and prestige are maintained or continuously improved in front of many people.

IV. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the study, it was found that the quality of service in public and private hospitals in the city of Medan has a good category in terms of tangibles and other dimensions such as reliability, responsiveness, and assurance. The majority of patients are satisfied with the facilities provided and the services provided by hospital staff. However, there are significant differences between government and private hospitals in several service quality dimensions. Private hospitals provide better reliability, responsiveness, and assurance services than government hospitals. Staff responsiveness, friendly service, and hospital security guarantees significantly influence patient satisfaction. The results of this study are in line with previous studies, which show that these factors have a positive influence on patient satisfaction. Therefore, it is necessary to improve the quality of service in government hospitals, especially regarding staff responsiveness, friendly attitude, and guaranteed patient safety. Thus, this study provides a better understanding of service quality in government and private hospitals in Medan City and its effect on patient satisfaction. This can be the basis for developing strategies and improving hospital services to increase patient satisfaction in the future.

V. ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We want to thank all parties supporting and contributing to this research. Thanks to the respondents who participated in this study and provided valuable time and information. With their participation, this research was successful. We would also like to thank the government and private hospitals for providing the necessary access and documentation for data collection. Their contribution is significant in the smooth running of this research.

Furthermore, we thank the library and related literature for providing information and references supporting this research. Thank you to the supervising lecturers and research colleagues who have provided direction, guidance, and valuable input in the preparation of this study. Finally, we express our appreciation to all parties that we cannot mention one by one but who provided support and encouragement during this research. Our sincere thanks go to all those who have played a role in this research. Hopefully, the results of this research can contribute to and benefit the development of health services in the future.

REFERENCES

- [1] Al Khattab, S. A., & Aldehayyat, J. S. (2011). Perceptions of Service Quality in Jordanian Hotels. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 6(7), 226–233. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ijbm.v6n7p226>
- [2] Alkuwaiti, A., Maruthamuthu, T., & Akgun, S. (2020). Factors associated with the quality of outpatient service: The application of factor analysis—A case study. *International Journal of Healthcare Management*, 13(S1), 88–93. <https://doi.org/10.1080/20479700.2017.1422910>
- [3] Donabedian, A. (1989). The Quality of Care: How Can It Be Assessed? *JAMA: The Journal of the American Medical Association*, 261(8), 1151. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.1989.03420080065026>
- [4] Faisal, A. S., Haque, R., Rahman, A. K., & Connie, A. (2020). The Influence of e-Service Quality Dimensions on Customer Satisfaction and Purchase Intention: An Indian e-Market Perspective. *Asian Journal of Technology & Management Research*, 10(1), 1–22.
- [5] Ghozali, I. (2018). *Aplikasi Analisis Multivariate dengan Program IBM SPSS 25*. Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro: Semarang.
- [6] KARS. (2017). Standar Nasional Akreditasi Rumah Sakit Edisi 1. In *Standar Nasional Akreditasi Rumah Sakit* (Vol. 1).
- [7] Kementerian Kesehatan RI. (2009). UU No. 44 Tahun 2009 Tentang Rumah Sakit. *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia*, 1, 41. <https://peraturan.go.id/common/dokumen/ln/2009/uu0442009.pdf>
- [8] Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. a., & Berry, L. L. (1988). SERQUAL: A Multiple-Item scale for Measuring Consumer Perceptions of Service Quality. *Journal of Retailing*, 64(1), 12–40. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0148-2963\(99\)00084-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0148-2963(99)00084-3)
- [9] Ramez, W. S. (2012). Patients ' Perception of Health Care Quality , Satisfaction and Behavioral Intention : An Empirical Study in Bahrain. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(18), 131–141.
- [10] Safitri, I., & Kautsar, A. P. (2013). Riview Jurnal: Peningkatan Mutu Pelayanan Kesehatan Dirumah Sakit Menggunakan Metode Lean Management. *Farmaka Suplemen*, 15(1), 47–53.

- [11] Soekidjo Notoatmodjo. (2012). *Metodologi Penelitian Kesehatan*. Rineka Cipta.
- [12] Sugiyono. (2019). *Statistika untuk Penelitian* (3rd ed.). CV. Alfabeta.
- [13] Suwarno, B., & Nugroho, A. (2023). *Kumpulan Variabel-Variabel Penelitian Manajemen Pemasaran (Definisi & Artikel Publikasi)* (Ed. 1st). Bogor: Halaman Moeka Publishing.
- [14] Suwarno, B., Rizal, S., Novalinda Ginting, C., Ermi Girsang, Alamsyah, B., & Tua Siregar, R. (2023). Analysis of Post-COVID-19 Hospital Service Quality: A Study Based on Patient Perceptions. *European Business & Management*, 9(2), 22–31. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ebm.20230902.11>
- [15] Wahdania, Saleh, D., & Fatmawati. (2015). Indeks Kepuasan Pasien Terhadap Pelayanan Rumah Sakit Umum daerah (RSUD) Kabupaten Polewali Mandar. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 1(1), 61–70.
- [16] Waine, I., Meliala, A., & Siswianti, V. D. Y. (2022). Penanganan Komplain Di Rumah Sakit. *Jurnal Manajemen Pelayanan Kesehatan*, 23(04), 127–132. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jmpk.v23i04.4253>